Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
4/4A/4B/4S	Mold-Buckley- Hawarden- Broughton- Saltney-Chester (Evenings & Sundays)	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.39	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers & satisfies criteria well. Represents good value for money. Continue with de-minimis arrangement and/or negotiate with operator to see if any journeys can be commercialised	No negative comments received relating to the review - two comments received supporting review; other comments received related to punctuality/reliability on the route. Service is largely commercial, but FCC pays for evening journeys after 1800 Mon-Sat and for diversion via Broughton Retail Park / St David's Park on Sundays	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current de-minimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.
3/3A	Mold-Buckley- Penyffordd- Broughton-Salney- Chester (Evenings)	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.59	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers & satisfies criteria well. Represents good value for money. Continue with de-minimis arrangement and/or negotiate with operator to see if any journeys can be commercialised	No comments received relating to the review, but several comments received regarding recent reliability issues on the route, which should have now been resolved. Additionally, several suggestions made regarding to the route followed, which will be passed on to the bus company, since the service is mainly commercial with FCC only subsidising journeys after 1800 Mon-Sat and diversion of service via Penyffordd and Broughton Village in the evenings	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current de-minimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.
X44 / X55	Mold-Buckley- Dobshill- Penymynydd- Broughton- Chester	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.38	LOW	Very low cost per passenger and high passenger numbers. Satisfies criteria and represents very good value for money. Continue with de-minimis arrangement and/or negotiate with operator to see if any journeys can be commercialised	received, which will be passed on to the bus company. Mainly commercial, but FCC pay for all journeys to be diverted via	passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current de-minimis arrangements and review in 12 months'
10	Connah's Quay- Shotton- Queensferry- Chester (Sunday Evenings)	De-minimis (commercial)	£2.15	MEDIUM	Cost per passenger is medium and passenger numbers average, but given that less than 5% of the service is subsidised, it represents good value for money. Continue with deminimis arrangement and review in 12 months' time	the cost of fares and requesting a service to Northop Hall. The comments received	Subsidy provided contributes to the viability of the core commercial service and fills the gap in service that would otherwise exist after 1800 hours. Passenger travel needs are justified in line with policy. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with de-minimis payment and review in 12 months' time
13	Chester-Saltney- Broughton- Buckley-Mold- Loggerheads (Sundays)	Tendered subsidised	£16.01	HIGH	High cost per passenger and poor performance in terms of passenger growth. Withdraw service. Serve notice on contract to end 31/10/2013	Only one comment received relating to the Service 13, which was in support of withdrawing the service. Wholly subsidised. Other journeys already provided on services 4A/4S on Sundays between Chester-Saltney-Broughton-Buckley-Mold.	High cost per passenger, very low passenger numbers and passenger travel needs do not meet criteria of policy. Consequently, withdraw service and serve notice on contract to end 31/03/2013.
26 / 27	Mold-Leeswood- Caergwrle- Wrexham (early morning)	De-minimis (commercial)	£3.34	MEDIUM	Medium cost per passenger & low passenger numbers, but mitigated by fact that Wrexham CBC jointly subsidise service. Consider withdrawing subsidised journey unless it serves a specific purpose.	towards cost of running this journey. Rest	Medium cost per passenger and low passenger numbers, no justification for supporting 0615 journey. Consequently, withdraw subsidy and give notice to end de-minimis arrangements for the journey at 0615 with effect from 31/03/2013.
11	Rhyl-Holywell- Chester (Evenings Sundays)	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.61	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers. Service performs well for an inter-urban service & provides good value for money. Consider voluntary quality partnership with Arriva and/or commercialising some journeys	Several responses received in relation to the Consultation. A couple of respondents suggested withdrawal of the evening service. Others have requested a more frequent service between Flint and Chester and serving Foregate Street in Chester instead of or as well as the Bus Exchange. Another comment related to the length of journey time and that it is quicker to go by train or car to Chester. Officers also met with Flint Town Council on 23/09/13. FCC currently subsidises all Sunday evening journeys between Rhyl, Holywell, Connah's Quay, Queensferry & Chester (after 1800); some evening journeys Rhyl-Holywell-Flint (Mon-Sat) and one early morning journey 0620 Holywell-Chester. Daytime journeys are commercial.	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current de-minimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.

Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
12	Connah's Quay- Shotton-Deeside Hospital- Broughton- Saltney-Chester	De-minimis (commercial)	Unknown - No figures provided by Arriva to date		Unable to assess against matrix of cost per passenger. Diversion of services via Mancot, Sandycroft & Manor Lane are still required. Arriva have recently approached the Council with regard to future opportunities e.g. serving Deeside College. Continue dialogue with Arriva regarding commercial opportunities	lifeline to people living in the Higher Shotton area. Service 12 has benefitted from investment by FCC/Taith since 2008 towards 50% of the cost of purchasing 5 brand new low floor easy access vehicles.	Unable to assess against matrix of cost per passenger, as no figures provided by Arriva to date. However, passenger travel needs are justified in terms of policy and specified criteria. No immediate changes proposed, but continue dialogue with the bus company regarding commercial opportunities and review in 12 months' time
9	Mold-Northop- Connah's Quay- Chester	Tendered subsidised	£0.53	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and satisfies criteria reasonably well. Continue with payment for serving Countess Hospital. Payment for vehicles due to finish on 31/08/2013. Seek possible contribution from Cheshire		During the course of the review and consultation period, the bus company withdrew this commercial service, despite the low cost per passenger and high passenger numbers. FCC has subsequently replaced the service with a temporary tendered service, but to a reduced frequency due to budgetary constraints. New contract to be tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract. Potential to combine with Service 6 in future
хэ	Connah's Quay- Queensferry- Broughton Park- Wrexham	Tendered subsidised	£0.93	LOW	for serving Higher Kinnerton & Wrexham Maelor. Payment for	Several comments received from people who rely on the X9 to get to Wrexham Maelor Hospital and service is used for access to doctors and local shopping in Connah's Quay.	During the course of the review and consultation period, the bus company withdrew this commercial service, despite the low cost per passenger. FCC has subsequently replaced the service with a temporary tendered service, but to a reduced frequency due to budgetary constraints. New contract to be tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 on a 3/4 year contract. Requires involvement from Wrexham County Borough Council
11	Rhyl-Holywell- Chester (Evenings Mon-Sat)	Tendered subsidised	£2.84	MEDIUM	satisfies criteria. Consider withdrawal of some journeys. Serve notice on existing operator and either re-tender or consider voluntary quality	Wholly subsidised with contract due to	Medium cost per passenger, average passenger numbers, but meets passenger travel needs specified in policy. Re-tender January 2014 to market test value for money. Requires involvement from Denbighshire
14	Mold-Caerwys- Bodfari-Denbigh	De-minimis (commercial)	£14.14	HIGH	High cost per passenger, very low passenger numbers & unsustainable. Withdraw & serve notice on existing de-minimis agreement. Re-tender along with Townlynx element (see below) with several options including reduced frequency during daytime i.e. 2 hourly and demand responsive service to rural villages. Consultation required with Denbighshire	boundary mileage. GHA provide 2-hourly service in between Townlynx journeys thereby creating hourly service during daytime. Denbighshire has confirmed support for a 2-hourly service during daytime, but requested that peak journeys are retained for workers and students. Letter also received from Caerwys	High cost per passenger and low passenger numbers. Withdraw & serve notice on existing de-minimis agreement. Combine with subsidised tendered service 14 and tender as one contract in January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract. Peak journeys for pupils, students and workers to be retained, but tender to include options for reducing frequency to 2 hourly off-peak during daytime (Monday-Friday) and option for demand responsive service to Lixwm, Rhes-y-Cae, Moel-y-Crio
40	Mold-Nercwys- Treuddyn- Llanfynydd-Ffrith- Cymau-Wrexham	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.58	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers. Reasonable value for money, especially for peak school journeys. Continue with current de-minimis agreements and review in 12 months' time	Another related to reliability/punctuality of the service, which will be passed on to the bus company. FCC pay for supply of 53- seater on peak journeys that serve Mold Campus on school days only, as well as diversion of service via Nercwys & Tan-yr-	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs in line with policy. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current deminimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.

Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
99	Sandycroft- Queensferry- Connah's Quay- Northop-Mold	Statutory School	£2.75	MEDIUM		peak school bus is relatively low and service has to be provided in order to	Statutory school contract and therefore unable to withdraw support. Re-tender contract January 2014 for new contract to commence April 2014
SP1/SP2	Mold-Buckley- Queensferry- Deeside Industrial Park-Ellesmere Port	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.67	LOW	passenger numbers & satisfies criteria very well in terms of access to employment/encouraging economic growth. Continue dialogue with Cheshire and seek enhancements for further opportunities in terms of access to employment. Discuss options of providing service without	in discussion with Cheshire regarding joint enhancements and possible re-branding of	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs in line with policy. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue to support and continue partnership working with Cheshire West & Chester regarding joint enhancements and developing the service. Review in 12 months' time
A	Buckley Town Service (Buckley- Precinct Way- Southdown)	Tendered subsidised	£1.70	LOW	Cost per passenger is medium / passenger numbers are low-medium, but passenger travel needs may be justified e.g. rail connections. Withdraw / Seek alternative transport solutions (e.g. demand responsive service) and/or re-tender with revised timetables	state that service provides a lifeline to people with mobility problems or without a car, in order to access doctors, local shopping and connecting to mainline bus and rail services Wholly subsidised service, originally introduced to provide connections to/from Buckley Railway	Cost per passenger reassessed due to previous inaccuracy. Cost per passenger is low, passenger numbers medium-high. Continue to support the service, but requires re-tendering. Contract to be tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 on a 3/4 year contract. Re-tender with 2 options: Monday to Saturday service and Monday to Friday service
14C	Holywell-Lixwm- Mold (School)	Statutory School	£5.23	HIGH	to provide statutory home to school transport service. Due to high cost per passenger, service to be re-	Several comments received regarding the number 14C service. The review only relates to the wholly subsidised school journeys to Mold Campus (53-seater Cilcain-Rhydymwyn-Ysgol Maes Garmon/Mold Alun)	High cost per passenger and low passenger numbers. Statutory school journey so unable to withdraw completely. De-register as a service and re-tender in January 2014 as a closed school contract to commence April 2014.
22/22A	Holway-Holywell- Pen-y-Maes / Brynford	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.54	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger number particularly in terms of concessionaires. Tender in order to market test in terms of value for money & consider whether early morning/late afternoon journeys are still required.		Low cost per passenger and high passenger numbers. Continue to support the service and work with the operator to develop the service and determine whether early morning/late afternoon journeys are still required. Unable to tender as service is commercial.
110	Aston-Northop Hall-Northop- Sychdyn-Mold (School)	Statutory School	£4.24	MEDIUM		service. Operation of service 110 Aston to Mold Campus on School Days and School	
124	Holywell- Rhosesmor-Lixwm Brynford-Holywell High School	Statutory School	£7.73	HIGH	children - no evidence of non-school use). Currently only 17 eligible pupils using service & this number likely to drop further in September 2013.	for Holywell High School from Pentre	High cost per passenger and low passenger numbers. Statutory school journey so unable to withdraw altogether. De-register as a service & replace with closed school contract minibus (16 seats). Contract to be tendered in January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract.

Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
126	Holywell-Pentre Halkyn-Halkyn- Rhosesmor-Mold	De-minimis (commercial)	£1.07	LOW	Low cost per passenger & reasonable passenger numbers given semi-rural communities served. Continue with de-minimis payment and review in 12 months' time	people who don't have access to transport, unemployed, disabled, low income families and live in isolated areas. FCC currently pays for the diversion of	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current deminimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.
127	Mold-Rhes-y-Cae- Lixwm-Brynford- Pantasaph-Carmel- Holway	Statutory School	£2.28	MEDIUM	Medium cost per passenger & high passenger numbers (70+ eligible pupils). Statutory home to school transport provision. Re-tender	No comments received in relation to the 127 service. Contract is for the operation of two peak journeys from Holway, Carmel, Gorsedd, Pantasaph, Brynford, Lixwm, Rhes-y-Cae to Mold Campus.	Statutory school contract and therefore unable to withdraw support. Re-tender contract January 2014 for new contract to commence April 2014
14A	Afonwen-Caerwys- Gorsedd-Carmel- Holywell-Holywell High School	Statutory School	£8.50	HIGH	passenger numbers which are largely concessionaires or school children. Currently only 11 eligible pupils using service & this number likely to drop further in September 2013. Consider withdrawing & replacing with dedicated school taxi / minibus (8-seats)	Several comments received with regard to the daytime service and letter received from Caerwys Community Council. Most requests were for additional journeys on the service, particularly late afternoon for Carmel and Gorsedd. Contract is for the operation of two peak school journeys only Afonwen-Caerwys-Gorsedd-Carmel-Holywell-Holywell High School, which is the subject of this review.	High cost per passenger and low passenger numbers. Statutory school journey so unable to withdraw altogether. De-register as a service & replace with closed school contract minibus (8 seats).
18	Flint-Holywell- Prestatyn-Rhyl	De-minimis (commercial)	£1.38	LOW			Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers. Continue to support service, but review current de-minimis arrangements with the bus company and in collaboration with Denbighshire. Review in 12 months' time
19	Flint-Holywell- Prestatyn-Rhyl	De-minimis (commercial)	£2.12	MEDIUM	Medium cost per passenger, with average passenger numbers. Journeys to more remote villages only run on demand and require prebooking. Further work required to determine future viability of these journeys. Review current de-minimis arrangements with the operator in collaboration with Denbighshire	A couple of comments received from respondents living in Carmel and Gorsedd, requesting journeys in the afternoons instead of demand responsive journeys, which have to be pre-booked. One comment received from a Trelawnyd resident who was content with the current service. FCC subsidises certain elements of the service such as diversion of service via Tre-Mostyn, Trelogan, Llanasa and Gwaenysgor, but some of the de-minimis agreements are historical and need to be reviewed. Denbighshire also contribute towards cross-boundary mileage	Medium cost per passenger with average passenger numbers, but passenger travel needs justified in line with policy. Review current de-minimis arrangements with the bus company in order to improve service performance and increase passenger usage. Review in 12 months' time
20	Holywell-Bagillt- Flint-Connah's Quay-Shotton- Deeside Industrial Park	Demand Responsive Contract (as part of Deeside Shuttle Service)	£5.38	HIGH	passengers are and where they're travelling to in order to determine	No comments received regarding this service. Wholly subsidised. Provision of 2 peak journeys for workers accessing Deeside Industrial Park (arrive 0750 / depart 1701)	High cost per passenger and low passenger numbers, but provides essential access to employment on Deeside Industrial Park for workers. Tender as two options: Stand-alone contract and as part of Deeside Shuttle service on a more demand responsive basis. Tender in January 2014 for contract to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract
23	Maes Pennant- Greenfield- Holywell-Holywell Community Hospital	Demand Responsive Contract (as part of Deeside Shuttle Service)	£2.31	MEDIUM	Community Hospital in Holywell.	No comments received regarding the number 23 service. Serves Holywell Community Hospital	Medium cost per passenger, average passenger numbers and passenger travel needs are justified. Explore potential for covering service by another service and/or re-tender contract in January 2014 to commence April 2014

Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
7, 7X	Mold-Buckley- Ewloe- Queensferry- Shotton-Deeside College	Statutory School/College	£5.00	HIGH	No action proposed regarding service provision, but consider whether the service needs to be registered as a bus service or whether it would be better used as a closed college contract. Also, consider single-decker instead of double-decker. Contract due to be re-tendered in 2014. Subsidised by Education and Deeside College. Discretionary post-16 transport for Deeside College & Deeside Consortium students	at peak times. Contract also includes journeys for Deeside Consortium during the daytime, which are not registered and	High cost per passenger, low passenger numbers, but carries eligible and non-eligible students to/from Deeside College. Unable to de-register as a service bus due to numbers of fare paying passengers using the service. Contract to be tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract.
D42	Mold-Caergwrle- Wrexham	Demand Responsive Contract (as part of Deeside Shuttle Service)	operated Deeside Shu (see overa passenger		Further work required to identify passenger numbers & cost per passenger. If cost per passenger is high, consider where and why people are using the service and potential for a demand-responsive taxi service instead		Further research required to identify where, when and why people are using the service - to be undertaken by the Rural Transport Project Officer. Tender as two options: Stand alone contract and as part of the Deeside Shuttle Service in January 2014 with new contracts commencing April 2014
14	Mold-Caerwys- Bodfari-Denbigh	Tendered subsidised	£10.46	HIGH	·	jobs, education and social/extra-curricular activites. One comment related to integration with trains and being able to get to Mold for connecting services to Flint Station. Proportion of cost shared with Denbighshire for cross-boundary mileage. GHA provide 2-hourly service in between Townlynx journeys thereby creating hourly service during daytime (see commercial service 14 above). Denbighshire has confirmed support for a 2-hourly service	from 7th November 2013 on the same basis as the previous service. However, the contract will be re-tendered in January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a reduced frequency 2 hourly during the daytime, retaining peak journeys in both directions for school pupils, students and workers, but with an option not to serve some rural villages. Involvement required from Denbighshire County Council
28	Wrexham-Hope- Penyffordd- Buckley-Mold-Flint	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.51	LOW	Low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers. Good value for money, especially for peak school journeys. Continue with current deminimis agreements and review in 12 months' time.	and supported current service level. This	Service performs well with low cost per passenger, high passenger numbers and justified passenger travel needs. Unable to tender as service is commercial. Consequently, no changes proposed. Continue with current de-minimis arrangements and review in 12 months' time.
28X	Greenfield- Holywell-Bagillt- Flint-Northop- Mold	De-minimis (commercial)	£0.00	NO SUBSIDY	No action proposed - commercial service - no subsidy given at present	No comments received relating to this service. Commercial service. Wholly commercial bus service provided by Townlynx without subsidy	No action proposed - commercial service - no subsidy given at present
6	Queensferry- Connah's Quay- Mold-Pantymwyn	De-minimis (Commercial) up to 06/11/13, but tendered subsidised from 07/11/13	£1.17	LOW	Low cost per passenger, reasonable passenger numbers (mainly concessions 70%). However, recent withdrawal of the section between Queensferry & Chester by the bus company has left people from Sealand Manor with no service and for people from Northop Hall with no direct buses to Chester and no buses from Mold to Northop Hall on a Saturday afternoon. Continue dialogue with the commercial operator to see if connections to/from Northop Hall/Sealand Manor can be improved or reinstated.	4 from Sealand Manor. Most respondents requested a direct bus from Northop Hall to Chester to avoid having to change buses in Connah's Quay/Shotton. Most respondents stated that they relied on the service for access to other facilities such as doctors, local shopping and many	During the course of this review, the bus company has withdrawn this commercial service further by curtailing the section of the route between Mold and Queensferry, despite the low cost per passenger. FCC will be replacing the service with a temporary tendered service (re-numbered to Service 8), but to a reduced frequency due to budgetary constraints. Contract to be re-tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract. Potential to combine with Service 9 in future

Service	Route	Type of Service	Cost per Passenger	RAG Status	Options presented to Scrutiny Committee on 23rd July 2013	Summary of Consultation Responses & Supplementary Notes	Proposals
1, 2, X1	Mold-Ruthin	Tendered subsidised (under contract to Denbighshire)	under contract to Denbighshire & no passenger figures provided by GHA		to Denbighshire. However, Denbighshire report that cost per		Service operated under contract to Denbighshire County Council. No known changes proposed at present.
DB1/DB2, DB3	Mold-Treuddyn / Leeswood - Higher Kinnerton - Chester - Blacon	(under contract	Unknown - Operated under contract to Cheshire West and Chester & no passenger figures provided by GHA Coaches to date		Unknown - Operated under contract to Cheshire West and Chester & no passenger figures provided by GHA	who say that they rely on the service for	Service operated under contract to Cheshire West and Chester Council. No known changes proposed at present.
14C	Holywell-Lixwm- Mold	Demand Responsive Contract (as part of Deeside Shuttle Service)	Deeside Shuttle Service (see overall cost per passenger for Deeside		Further work required to identify passenger numbers & cost per passenger, as figures are contained within the Deeside Shuttle costs and are difficult to separate out	communities and need access to health and local shopping for older population who may not drive, as well as encouraging travel by young people for jobs, education	Further research required to identify where, when and why people are using the service - to be undertaken by the Rural Transport Project Officer. Tender as two options: Stand alone contract and as part of the Deeside Shuttle Service in January 2014 with new contracts commencing April 2014. No proposals to reduce service levels
16	Chester-Lache- Saltney	Commercial	£0.00	NO SUBSIDY		Commercial bus service. No comments received and not part of the Flintshire review on subsidised service.	No action proposed - commercial service - no subsidy given at present
Deeside Shuttle	Deeside Shuttle	Demand Responsive Contract (as part of Deeside Shuttle Service)	£4.77	MEDIUM	However, current contract is due to	No comments received regarding the Consultation on the Demand responsive Deeside Shuttle Transport Service	Medium cost per passenger, but passenger travel needs are justified in line with policy. Contract to be re-tendered January 2014 to commence April 2014 for a 3/4 year contract.